# **2023 IACR Conference**Abstracts

Describing + Explaining + Evaluating: The Scientific Method Revisited

# **2023 IACR Conference**

# **Abstracts**

Describing + Explaining + Evaluating: The Scientific Method Revisited

August 9-11, 2023 **Conference Parallel Sessions** 

Ateneo de Manila University Metro Manila, Philippines

The International Association For Critical Realism
The Ateneo Gokongwei Brothers School of Education and Learning Design

# **Schedule**

# Wednesday, 9 August

PHT	Activity				
08:00	Morning Reception				
09:00	Welcome and Introduction Roberto Yap, SJ (President, Ateneo de Manila University) Douglas Porpora (President, International Association for Critical Realism)				
09:30	<b>Keynote Address 1:</b> Grant Banfield (Journeys with a Permissive Meta-Theory)				
11:00	Coffee and tea				
11:30	Parallel Sessions:  Parallel Session 1 Lighthouse	Parallel Session 2 Hive	Parallel Session 3 Teaching Lab		
13:00	Lunch				
14:00	<b>Keynote Address 2:</b> Ismael Al-Amoudi (Margaret Archer's Contribution to the Centre for Social Ontology: From Morphogenic to Post-Human Society)				
15:30	Coffee and tea				
16:00	Parallel Sessions:  Parallel Session 4 Lighthouse	Parallel Session 5 Hive	Parallel Session 6 Teaching Lab	Parallel Session 7 Co-Lab	
18:00	Tribute to Professor Maggie Archer				
19:30	End of Conference Day 1				

All plenary sessions will be held at The Loft, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté.

Parallel sessions will be held at the following:

Lighthouse	JJ Atencio Lighthouse for New Learning, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté
Hive	Learning Design Hive, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté
Teaching Lab	Campos Interactive Teaching Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté
Co-Lab	Bank of Singapore Co-Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté

# Schedule

# Thursday, 10 August

PHT	Activity			
08:00	Morning Reception			
09:00	Panel Discussion 1: Sociology			
09:45	Panel Discussion 2: Natural Sciences			
10:30	Panel Discussion 3: Education			
11:15	Coffee and tea			
11:30	Panel Discussion 4: Philosophy			
12:15	Panel Discussion 5: Management and Organization Studies			
13:00	Lunch			
14:00	<b>Keynote Address 2:</b> Dave Elder-Vass (Inventing Financial Value: Creating a Critical Realist Theory)			
15:30	Coffee and tea			
16:00	Parallel Sessions:    Parallel Session 8   Parallel Session 9   Parallel Session 10   Parallel Session 11   Co-Lab			
18:00	Socials and Conference Dinner Ubuntu Hall, Ground Floor, Areté			
19:30	End of Conference Day 2			

All plenary sessions will be held at The Loft, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté. Socials and Conference Dinner will be held at the Ubuntu Hall, Ground Floor, Areté.

Parallel sessions will be held at the following:

Lighthouse	JJ Atencio Lighthouse for New Learning, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté
Hive	Learning Design Hive, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté
Teaching Lab	Campos Interactive Teaching Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté
Co-Lab	Bank of Singapore Co-Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté

## Schedule

# Friday, 11 August

PHT	Activity				
08:00	Morning Reception				
	Parallel Sessions:				
09:00	Parallel Session 12 Lighthouse	Parallel Session 13 Hive	Parallel Session 14 Teaching Lab	Parallel Session 15 Co-Lab	
11:00	Coffee and tea				
11:30	Cheryl Frank Memorial Lecture: Priscilla Alderson (Critical Realism for Health and Illness Research: A Practical Introduction)				
13:00	Formal Closing of the Conference Lunch				
14:00	IACR Business Meeting (IACR members)				
	Ateneo Art Gallery Tour (Optional for non-IACR members)				

All plenary sessions will be held at The Loft, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté.

Parallel sessions will be held at the following:

**Lighthouse**JJ Atencio Lighthouse for New Learning, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté

**Hive** Learning Design Hive, 4f, Learning Innovation Wing, Areté

**Teaching Lab**Campos Interactive Teaching Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté
Bank of Singapore Co-Lab, 3f, Vicente Tiu Lim Synergy Hub, Areté

The Ateneo Art Gallery is on the Ground Floor of Areté.

## 12 Parallel Session 1

Wednesday, 9 August (11:30-13:00)

- 1A Creating new quantitative measures of reflexivity to help explain differences in the experiences of university students

  Richard Remelie (Manchester Metropolitan University, UK)
- Thinking like a critical realist and making it through the portal
  Karen Sheppard (The University of Queensland, Australia)
  Angela Davenport (ABI Rehabilitation New Zealand)
  Catherine Hastings (Macquarie University, Australia)
- From imagination to theory building: A critical realist bridge Caroline Kuhn (Bath Spa University, UK)

#### 15 Parallel Session 2

Wednesday, 9 August (11:30-13:00)

A morphogenetic approach to Elinor Ostrom's IAD framework: An ontological commitment and methodological strategy for researching water governance in the Post-colonial South

Prathiwi Widyatmi Putri, Andreas Thiel (University of Kassel, Germany)

2B Interrogating Climate Justice in Coastal Cities: Intersections of Vulnerability, Adaptation and Resilience

Emma Porio (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Inclusive policies in discriminatory culture: A critical institutional analysis of gender dimensions of local government institutions for natural resource management in Madhya Pradesh, India

Mahima Upadhyay (National Institute of Advanced Studies, India)

## 18 **Parallel Session 3**

Wednesday, 9 August (11:30-13:00)

- **3A** Living beyond the rainbow spectrum: The Spirituality and gender fluidity of Filipino college students (A Basis for Affirmative Counseling Approach)

  Matt Calvin Dadivas (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)
- Religion as technology

  Margaret Blackie (Rhodes University, South Africa)
- 3C Islamic Critical Realism and The Spiritual Heart: Implications for Research and Practice

Iznan Tarip (Universiti Brunei Darussalam)

21	<b>Paral</b>	le	Sess	ion 4	4
----	--------------	----	------	-------	---

Wednesday, 9 August (16:00-18:00)

- 4A <u>Philosophical Realism Today and metaReality</u>
  MinGyu Seo (Konyang University, South Korea)
- 4B A Conversation between Gregory Bateson and Roy Bhaskar: double binds, the sacred, and common sense

Rob Faure Walker (University College London, UK)

The Work Carried Out by the Concept of Alethia in and between Dialectic and the Philosophy of Meta-reality

Onur Özmen (Independent Researcher)

adological potential in the philosophy of metaDeality

4D <u>Methodological potential in the philosophy of metaReality</u> Eirin Annamo (Inland Norway University of Applied Sciences)

## 25 **Parallel Session 5**

Wednesday, 9 August (16:00-18:00)

- 5A Surface and depth in collaboration on complex welfare problems
  Lene Nyhus (Inland Norway University of Applied Sciences)
- Validating the adult social work measure 'KEY': Effectiveness of social work

Minna Kivipelto, Mirka Elovainio (Finnish Institution for Health and Welfare, Finland)

5C Critical Realist Approach to Conceptualize Health as a Mode
Kensuke Chikamori, Hitoshi Yoshimura, Shigeo Yamanaka,
Mayumi Sakamoto, Akiko Yoshida
(Kochi Gakuen University and Kochi Gakuen College, Japan)

5D <u>Examining Homeopathic methods - Critical Realist Perspectives</u>
Natalya Dinat (Durban University of Technology, South Africa)

#### 30 Parallel Session 6

Wednesday, 9 August (16:00-18:00)

6A Theorizing and practicing science and risk communication within a critical realism paradigm

Inez Ponce de Leon (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

6B From Hesitancy to Legitimacy and Beyond: A Critical Realist Multi-Case
Study of Trust Culture Legitimation in the Dengvaxia Vaccine Scandal
Karl Patrick Mendoza (University of Canterbury, New Zealand /
University of the Philippines Diliman)

34

6C	"Don't Panic, Don't Panic": Do responses to pro-eating disorder websites within the United Kingdom constitute a moral panic?  David Benbow (University of Sheffield, UK)
6D	A Deeper Picture: A Realist Semiotics of Non-Fiction Film Marc Bosward (University of Derby, UK)
Para	llel Session 7
	nesday, 9 August (16:00-18:00)
7A	Integrating Critical Realism in Futures Studies: Understanding Agency in a Polarized Society
	Nok Thasanawan Boonmavichit (Chiang Mai University, Thailand)
7B	Philosophy, Flourishing and Freedom: Critical Realism as Liberatory Methodology
	Angela Martinez Dy (Loughborough University London, UK)
7C	Against Adultism: Addressing the Problem of Gerontocratic Rule in Times of Democratic Sclerosis

38 Parallel Session 8

7D

Thursday, 10 August (16:00-18:00)

**Discourses** 

8A <u>Critical realism in institutional logics research: Frameworks based on Veblen and Gramsci</u>

Risk as Assemblages, The Case of Basel Bank Limiting Policies as

Joel Patomäki (University of Jyväskylä, Finland)

Juan Alberto Mercado (University of the Philippines Los Baños)

Christopher-David Preclik (Goethe University Frankfurt, Germany)

8B Luhmann's Systems Theory, Critical Realism, and the Morphogenetic Approach

Leland Joseph dela Cruz (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

8C Augmenting the Variegated Neoliberalization Thesis
Yazid Zahda, Karim Knio

(International Institite of Social Studies, The Netherlands)

8D <u>Speculative Realism - Implications for Political Analysis?</u> Stuart McAnulla (University of Leeds, UK)

42	Pai	rall	el	Ses	ssi	on	9
<b>→</b> ∠	Ги	all		JC.	<b>991</b>		

Thursday, 10 August (16:00-18:00)

9A On being disciplined by our disciplines in the epoch of coloniality: Impact on epistemic access in the field of science in higher education

Nkosinathi Madondo, Lethukuthula Khumalo, Neliswa Radebe (Mangosuthu University of Technology, South Africa)

9B A worked example of Archer's morphogenetic approach applied to curriculum change in Higher Education

Robyn Yucel (Deakin University, Australia)

9C Unpacking the concept of 'critical thinking' in education through Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu's thought

Nopparat Ruankool (University College London, UK)

9D <u>Irish Further Education and Training practitioner identities: an Archerian analysis</u>

Sarah Bates Evoy (South East Technological University, Ireland)

## 46 Parallel Session 10

Thursday, 10 August (16:00-18:00)

10A <u>Critical realism and systematic literature review: A joint approach for theory building?</u>

Li Li (Bath Spa University, UK)

10B Describing, Explaining, Evaluating: Applying Critical Realism To Real World Problems. Realist Evaluation Can Investigate What Works And For Whom: Utilizing Live Big Data From New York State (USA) And Manchester City Council (UK)

Mansoor Kazi (Realist Evaluation Inc., USA)

Theorizing transfactual conditions through concept formation: How critical realist and Grounded Theory researchers can collaborate in research practice

Michalis Christodoulou (Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece)

10D <u>Critical realist causality in case-study research</u>
Jack Newman (University of Manchester, UK)

## 50 Parallel Session 11

Thursday, 10 August (16:00-18:00)

11A Ontologies of the virtual world - is there a cyberspace
Raul Pertierra (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

11B Coming up a level? Deep and shallow ontologies in anthropology and the social sciences

Gene-George Earle (East Normal University, China)

11C <u>Dimensionality in Critical Realism</u>

Grant Banfield (University of South Australia) Brendan Cartmel (Independent Student)

11D <u>Learnable Enhanced Bhaskarian Ontology – LEBO</u> Luca Magni (Luiss Business School, Italy)

## 54 Parallel Session 12

Friday, 11 August (9:00-11:00)

12A Institutional entrepreneurship for inclusive business practice: A critical realist perspective

Benito Teehankee (De La Salle University, Philippines)

Social missions amid the pandemic: A critical realist explanation of select Philippine social enterprises' experiences

Shieradel Jimenez (De La Salle University, Philippines)

12C Rethinking stakeholders as whole persons: Implications for critical realist insighting in management and organizational research

Patrick Adriel Aure (De La Salle University, Philippines)

12D Streamlining Remote Work Operations through Critical Realist Action Research

Janice Alfonso, Frances Jeanne Sarmiento (De La Salle University, Philippines)

#### 58 Parallel Session 13

Friday, 11 August (9:00-11:00)

13A Explaining the drivers of community immersion outcomes among medical students: a realist-informed study

Celso Pagatpatan, Jr. (De La Salle Medical and Health Sciences / Institute, Philippines)

13B Reforming Assessment Practices in Healthcare Using Critical Realist Methodology

Priya Khanna (University of Sydney, Australia)

Relationships, relational configurations and relational goods: how patients and clinicians manage stigma together

Ismael Al-amoudi (Grenoble Ecole de Management, France) Anna Milena Galazka (Cardiff Business School, UK)

Residents' coping responses in collaborative housing during the COVID-19 pandemic. Applying Bhaskar's four-planar social being to tackle the affordability-integration-health nexus

Ivette Arroyo (Lund University, Sweden) Catherine Hastings (Macquarie University, Australia) Maryam Khatibi (Université de Lyon, France) Norma Montesino (Lund University, Sweden)

## 63 Parallel Session 14

Friday, 11 August (9:00-11:00)

14A <u>Wendt Revisited: A Refreshed Challenge for International Relations</u>
<u>Constructivism</u>

Yi Jian Ho (Sunway University, Malaysia)

14B <u>China's 'indisputable' framing of the 'Taiwan question': Discourse with 'Chinese characteristics'</u>

Martin Evenden (National Taichung University of Education, Taiwan)

14C <u>"No Abe, Yes Japan" Movement in 2019: Bolstering National Pride and Identity</u>

Gil-Soo Han (Monash University, Australia)

14D Psychoanalysis and Democracy

Carl Auerbach (Yeshiva University, USA)

#### 67 Parallel Session 15

Friday, 11 August (9:00-11:00)

15A Conflating the Metaphysical and Semantic

Vida Mia Valverde (Ateneo de Davao University, Philippines)

15B You Don't Have to Be Abstracted from the World to Know: Rethinking the Contemporary Knowing Subject

Agustin Martin Rodriguez (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

- 15C <u>Language and Translation in Bhaskar's notion of Scientific Development</u>
  Darren Anthony Cabildo (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)
- 15D <u>The Concept of Language: Bridging Critical Realism and Wittgenstein</u> lan Gabriel Kintanar (Xavier University–Ateneo de Cagayan, Philippines)

# Parallel 1 Session



# 1A Creating new quantitative measures of reflexivity to help explain differences in the experiences of university students

In response to research that has problematised the methodological validity of Archer's (2007) Internal Conversation Indicator (ICONI), this paper will present findings from a forthcoming doctoral thesis that created new quantitative measures of Communicative, Autonomous, Meta, and Fractured reflexivity. Although there were shortcomings with the new Communicative and Autonomous reflexivity measures, the attempts to create new valid and internally reliable measures of Meta and Fractured reflexivity were successful. This made it possible to analyse relationships between the reflexivity and motivations of 303 university students. Therefore, this paper will defend the arguments for using quantitative instruments like the ICONI, discuss methodological challenges, and identify opportunities for further developments.

Richard Remelie (Manchester Metropolitan University, UK)

Richard Remelie is a PhD researcher in the Department of Education at Manchester Metropolitan University. His academic background is in Sociology and Psychology.



# тhinking like a critical realist and making it through the portal

Critical realism has a reputation for being hard to grasp and overwhelming, requiring students and others new to the philosophy to invest substantial intellectual commitment and time to gain understanding. Likewise, a commonly expressed frustration is that it is difficult to operationalise critical realism as an empirical research methodology. Our paper investigates what makes it challenging for newcomers to critical realism to grow and feel confident in their philosophical knowledge and capacity to use the meta-theory in their research. In the first section, we introduce the theoretical framework of 'threshold concepts' (Meyer and Land, 2003), which explains how some new knowledge or ways of thinking might be considered 'troublesome' and take some time to arrive at. We illustrate the five qualities of 'threshold concepts' by analysing existing literature in which critical realist scholars describe their journey towards proficiency in critical realism. In the paper's second section, we apply the framework as a foundation to suggest practical approaches to cultivating increased knowledge of critical realism from three viewpoints. First, from the standpoint of the more experienced critical realist academic advisor or supervisor introducing critical realism to a student. Second, from the perspective of a budding critical realist scholar transforming their understanding through reflexivity. Third, we consider the role of critical realist communities of practice and peer-to-peer learning in overcoming barriers to difficult new knowledge for individuals. The paper concludes by asking: what kind of learning and teaching frameworks can the critical realist community build to better support apprentice critical realists?

**Karen Sheppard** (The University of Queensland, Australia) **Angela Davenport** (ABI Rehabilitation New Zealand) **Catherine Hastings** (Macquarie University, Australia)

Karen Sheppard is a Senior Learning Designer at the University of Queensland. In 2020, she completed her PhD at UQ. Karen's current research interests include a critical realist understanding of evaluation in higher education and the development of data agency and professional learning

Angela Davenport completed her DHSc through AUT University in 2020. Angela works as a Rehabilitation Nurse Advisor at ABI Rehabilitation. Her current research focuses on the contribution of rehabilitation nurses and their role in health coaching.

Catherine Hastings holds a PhD in sociology from Macquarie University and is currently Research Fellow at Macquarie Law School. Her interdisciplinary research concentrates on understanding issues of social justice and inequality alongside developing and evaluating policy and program responses for social change. Recent focus areas include legal needs assessment, the causes of homelessness for families and older women, and international student financial and housing precarity. The philosophy of critical realism informs her research.



# 1c From imagination to theory building: A critical realist bridge

This paper attempts to build a conceptual bridge between the process of imagination and that of theory building in the context of Critical Realism. Imagination can be understood as "the capacity to understand the actual in light of the possible" (Alexander, 2013), and one interesting definition of theory is that of disciplined imagination (Weick, 1989). This begs two questions, one about the meaning of 'disciplined' in the context of social science research and the other about the nature of the possibly, 'paradoxical' relationship between imagination and discipline. For the second question, I will venture to say that the relationship is dialectic. I will develop this further in the paper seeking to uncover the interplay between both, i.e. imagination and theory. But for the curious and impatient reader, the dialectical relationship has to do with my goal to find a novel synthesis between imagination and theory, as I believe they are in tension rather than opposition. In the first section, I explore imagination and intuition, presenting relevant examples from the natural and medical sciences. I also touch upon the role of heuristic/analytical tools as aids in the process of imagination. I then explore the process of theory building, including judgemental rationality and the critical feature of any good theory, i.e., its explanatory power and ask how these features constrain the process of imagination and how they can be mediated. I then explore the generative tension between imagination and theory, referring to a relevant example from medical science. I finalise my quest by expanding the understanding of imagination through Roland Barnett's work, which aims to give imagination a new and 'real' dimension. Key words: imagination; theory building; critical realism; social science research.

#### Caroline Kuhn (Bath Spa University, UK)

I am a senior lecturer in education and my research interest lies at the intersection of technology, philosophy, and society. I am interested in how technology-driven solutions can be meaningfully integrated into resource constraint contexts so that different ways of knowing and beings are respected. Digital inequality is something I also explore in my research. I am an editor for the journal of critical realism and I co-coordinate the working group on technology, innovation and design for the Human development capability association.

# Parallel 2 Session



# A morphogenetic approach to Elinor Ostrom's IAD framework: An ontological commitment and methodological strategy for researching water governance in the Post-colonial South

There is much to gain when combining the works of Margaret Archer and Elinor Ostrom in their resonances and take both amplitudes in synergy, to inform policy processes in general and improve water governance in particular. Archer's morphogenetic approach to structure and agency allows the components of Ostrom's framework of Institutional Analysis and Development (IAD) to play within the dynamic contours of stratified structural and institutional relations, rather than they perform in a single, conflated ontological terrain of social interactions. Elinor Ostrom does account for the complex and hierarchical nature of the social-and-biophysical worlds in her framework-theory-model approach to policy research and innovation. However, in its operation, the IAD Framework gives more emphasis on actual social interactions, or the so-called 'action situations,' and this is in congruence with the following problem. The IADF components of the so-called exogenous and endogenous structures are presented without an account of any temporal dimension. Consequently, in its use, the IADF shows rather static and mechanistic flows of individual actions (human and non-human) that might affect particular eventual outcomes, while the components and processes that are exogenous to the analysed action situations remain unexplained: their ways of coming into being (their origins) and/or their transformations, as well as their emergent impacts on the possibility changing action arenas. It is argued that, the incorporation of Margaret Archer's morphogenetic approach with its advocacy of time, or more precisely the different temporal dimensions attached to different structures and agencies, will make the contours of individual actions and action situations more visible. We ask: in what ways a refined interpretation of the Ostrom IAD Framework, informed by the critical realist morphogenetic approach to structure and agency, can quide our analysis for understanding community institutional dynamics and the possibilities of self-governance (their limits and promises beyond the state and the market), in transforming the current ill-performing urban water governance?

## Prathiwi Widyatmi Putri Andreas Thiel

(University of Kassel, Germany)

Prathiwi W. Putri is a Marie Sklodowska-Curie postdoctoral fellow at the University of Kassel, with the mentorship from Andreas Thiel. Prathiwi obtained her PhD in Engineering Science at KU Leuven, and had a previous postdoc at University of Copenhagen in global development.

Andreas Thiel is a professor of International Agricultural Poliy and Resource Governance at University of Kassel. He is also a member of the Ostrom Workshop/ the Bloomington School of Political Economy Network.



# **Interrogating Climate Justice in Coastal**Cities: Intersections of Vulnerability, Adaptation and Resilience

Coastal cities are the frontlines in interrogating climate justice in the Philippines and the Southeast Asian region. Highly urbanized areas are highly exposed and vulnerable to climate impact drivers (CIDs) such as floods, sea level rise (SLR), typhoons, urban heat index (UHI), droughts, seismic-related hazards, subsidence, etc. posing great challenges to coastal cities' striving for equitable growth, development and community resilience. This paper will explore how the concept of climate justice and structure-agency and culture (SAC) nexus critique of Archer and related epistemologies and methodologies allow us a critical understanding of transformative adaptation towards community resilience. Several studies conducted in Itbayat/Batanes, Camotes Island, Panacon/Levte, Dinagat and Siargao Islands provide illustrative cases on the dynamic interactions of climate vulnerability and the coastal cities' capacity to recover from disasters as mediated by hierarchies embedded in risk governance systems and their external partners, especially the private sector and multi-lateral donors. Interrogating climate justice and transformative adaptation leads to a more dynamic understanding of the intersectional relationships of social vulnerability, risk governance and community resilience of coastal urban development in Philippine cities.

#### **Emma Porio** (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Dr. Emma Porio is Professor, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, School of Social Sciences, Ateneo de Manila University and Science Research Fellow, Manila Observatory. She is President of the International Sociological Association (ISA), Clinical/Public Sociology Division (2019-2023) and of the Asia Pacific Sociological Association (2020-2023). Prof. Porio is Review Editor, Journal of Frontiers in Sustainable Cities Frontier (London), Principal Editorial Adviser of the Environment and Urbanization (Asia Edition) and Review Editor of the Journal of the Cities of the Global South. In 2021-2023, AD Scientific Index listed her as one of the most highly cited social scientists in the Philippines.



# A critical institutional analysis of gender dimensions of local government institutions for natural resource management in Madhya Pradesh, India

Ever since the narratives of women saving trees echoed beyond Himalayas, the inclusion of women remains an institutional imperative of policy interventions on decentralized natural resource management (NRM) in India. Thus, women are involved in various communitybased and co-management institutions established for resource management at the local level. Moreover, women are included in local government institutions as well. Locating NRM in the broader territory of development, local government institutions mainstream resource management into local development processes. As group identity is indicated to align women's needs and preferences with resource sustainability, it is likely that institutional outcomes on resource management will improve with the inclusion of women in local government. However, little is known how the inclusion of women, as political representatives, has influenced the involvement of local government in NRM at the ground level? We, therefore, look at the question with a critical lens by investigating the case of three village councils in the state of Madhya Pradesh, India. In line with the stratified ontology and mediated epistemology of critical realism, we capture the phenomenon in the domains of empirical, actual and real. Building on qualitative evidences, collected through household qualitative survey and focused group discussions with local government representatives and officials, our critical analysis suggests that women representatives do not alter the way the local governments are involved with NRM. We identify the institutions of decentralization and patriarchy as the underlying structure, and institutional compulsions, actors' rational calculations and their asymmetrical power possessions as the causal mechanisms that explain how gender identity of local government representatives influences (or does not influence) the NRM decision-making at local level.

## Mahima Upadhyay (National Institute of Advanced Studies, India)

Mahima Upadhyay is a Postdoc Associate in Inequality and Human Development Programme at National Institute of Advanced Studies, Bengaluru, India. She recently completed her Ph.D. in Development Studies from the Institute for Social and Economic Change, Bengaluru, India. Her thesis examines the factors that influence the local government in their NRM interventions. Her research interests include public policy and institutions, natural resource management, gender inequalities and development. Prior to her academic endeavors, she has been engaged with various development issues, including decentralized institutions and development, disaster risk reduction and women leadership in the capacity of a development professional, working for a couple of NGOs and the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research.

# Parallel Session



# 3A Living beyond the rainbow spectrum: The Spirituality and gender fluidity of Filipino college students (A Basis for Affirmative Counseling Approach)

Counselors in Philippine society protect and become allies for students who are members of the LGBTQIA+ community. The design and delivery of counseling services are being strengthened to help them. The present study aimed to discover, explore, and understand the lived experiences of Filipino LGBTOIA+ college students in terms of their spirituality and gender fluidity. Using grounded theory, the study utilized qualitative research, phenomenology, and social constructivism as approaches to achieve its objectives. 10 LGBTQIA+ participants, who report having a sense of spirituality and are experiencing gender fluidity, underwent semistructured interviews. As the main research instrument, they were interviewed with a validated aide memoire. Utilizing Thematic Analysis, the study came-up with 7 conceptual themes (Consolation, Ordeal, Meaninglessness, Placidity, Assimilation, Self-Awareness, and Self-Fulfillment) reflected in the hypothesized theoretical framework The Life C.O.M.P.A.S.S. of Spirituality and Gender Fluidity. This can be used as a pedagogical tool for articulation and exploration in counseling. This may also serve as basis for creating other interventions, especially for the Affirmative Counseling Approach, with spiritual, LGBTQIA+ individuals as they find out and form their spiritual and gender identities/expressions, and live their unique lives to the fullest of their potentials and capabilities in their personal, social worlds.

#### Matt Calvin Dadivas (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Mr. Matt Calvin S. Dadivas is a Guidance Counselor from the Ateneo de Manila University-Senior High School where he handles senior high school students. He graduated from the Ateneo de Manila University with a degree Master of Arts in Education major in Guidance and Counseling. Aside from his full-time work, he also does freelance consultancy work as a Registered Psychometrician and Guidance Counselor with students and other clients.



# зв Religion as technology

Blackie has argued that the practice of science can be viewed as 'science' where physical world is taken as fixed and concepts are developed to explain that which exists. Or the practice of science can be viewed as 'technology' where the concepts are taken as fixed and used to change the physical world. In this paper, I will extend this idea to religion. For many practitioners of the Christian faith tradition - the concepts - theology and dogma is taken as fixed and this is then used to attempt to change the social world. I argue that this substantially limits the development of theology and this is likely detrimental both on an individual and on the level of the social group. It is necessary in our current age to develop practices which start from the reality of the divine, but hold theological 'truths' to be open to inquiry.

## Margaret Blackie (Rhodes University, South Africa)

Prof Mags Blackie holds two PhDs one in chemistry and one in education. In addition to experience teaching in both of the fields, she also teaches theology at Master's Level at Stellenbosch University. She is currently based at the Centre of Higher Education Research Teaching and Learning at Rhodes University.



# 3c Islamic Critical Realism and The Spiritual Heart: Implications for Research and Practice

Religion is often not taken seriously in research but has many potentials to do so. Taking an Islamic critical realist perspective, this research highlights the role of the 'spiritual heart' in organisation studies, which then have implications on ontology, epistemology, and axiology. To illustrate, the research demonstrates the role of the 'spiritual heart' in shaping two fields: good governance and organisational moral learning. This presentation shows that an ontological element present in the religious sphere can have significant implications for research and practice.

## **Iznan Tarip** (Universiti Brunei Darussalam)

Dr Iznan Tarip is a lecturer in Islamic Governance. He obtained his doctorate in 2019 from Lancaster University Business School, UK, a quadruple-accredited world-ranked institution. He then joined UBD in 2020. Drawing upon extensive knowledge of Islamic governance, policy analysis, strategic management, leadership, organisational moral learning, management consultancy, Islamic psychology, and the spiritual heart, Dr Iznan aims to help others unlock their true potential in their personal and professional life.

# Parallel 4 Session



# AA Philosophical Realism Today and metaReality

21st Century's philosophical realism theories are converging on overcoming the effects of anthropocentrism prevalent in the last centuries. In this presentation, I compare the anti-anthropic approaches in the theory of Bruno Latour, Donna Haraway, Graham Harman, Quentin Meillassoux, Maurizio Farraris, and Roy Bhaskar. While comparative analysis of these theories I emphasize the importance of the subject theory of Bhaskar's metaReality.

MinGyu Seo (Konyang University, South Korea)

Dr. MinGyu Seo is a philosophy professor at Konyang University, South Korea. He received his Ph.D. at the State University of New York at Buffalo, USA. His Ph.D. research was about finding Roy Bhaskar's intellectual trajectory from critical realism to metaReality.



# A Conversation between Gregory Bateson and Roy Bhaskar: double binds, the sacred, and common sense

Gregory Bateson's career from anthropologist, through his development of cybernetics and systems theory, to developing ideas around "the sacred", has parallels with Roy Bhaskar's academic life-journey. This paper proposes that as well as Bateson's theory of cybernetics and systemic thought making a contribution to basic and dialectic critical realism (Mingers, 2011), it also adds to our understanding of Bhaskar's metaReality. Similarities between the development of Bateson's work from 1936 to 1987 and Bhaskar's work from 1975 to 2016 enable the development of theory that adds to both of their respective appreciations of metaReality and the sacred. Thus, by starting a conversation between Bateson and Bhaskar, we can develop a higher order understanding of the world than proposed by Bhaskar's metaReality.

## Rob Faure Walker (University College London, UK)

Rob Faure Walker is an ESRC postdoctoral Fellow at IOE, Faculty of Education and Society, University College London where he runs the Critical Realism Reading Group with Prof Priscilla Alderson. His most recent book is The Emergence of 'Extremism' (2022) with Bloomsbury Academic.



# 4c The Work Carried Out by the Concept of Alethia in and between Dialectic and the Philosophy of Meta-reality

Dialectical critical realism (DCR) holds on to a differentiated unity of the truth and the good without collapsing virtue to knowledge, or ethicopolitical practice to scientific theory, and does this by introducing a non-propositionally conceived notion of truth, viz. alethia, which binds truth ontologically to ontology. But is a realism that takes the form of an anti-anthropism compatible with a nonpropositional conception of truth? In its ambition to uphold both, does DCR commit the reverse of the epistemic fallacy, which reduces being to its knowledge, by overexpanding an epistemological category, i.e. that of truth, into the whole of ontology? In this working paper I analyse this key concept of DCR and its critiques, inquire into the potential strengths, weaknesses and stakes of offering an alethic theory of truth for critical realism and the philosophy of meta-reality (PMR), and offer a positive reading of it. I compare DCR's theory with other theories of truth within and outside critical realism, relate DCR to earlier attempts to connect the notions of truth and the good, and discuss whether PMR can be interpreted as a radical deepening of the notion of alethic truth, together with a radical expansion of the third level of DCR's MELD schema, viz. totality.

## **Onur Özmen** (Independent Researcher)

Onur Özmen completed his PhD on the philosophy of critical realism and ethics at the Institute of Education, University College London in 2022



# 4D Methodological potential in the philosophy of metaReality

Critical realism advocates methodological pluralism, in the sense that different methods are appropriate to different research situations. In this presentation I want to open the understanding of methodological pluralism by looking into the methodological potentials of the philosophy of metaReality. Inviting the philosophy of metaReality into the discussion of methodology give us the possibility to develop new research tools, specifically in the qualitative research field, but also as an underlabourer for research approaches like phenomenology and habermasian critical research. Two research approaches will be presented: the ground state and the MELDARA model. From these two areas it is possible to draw research principles that can be used in research situations, like interviews, participant observations, action research, s-step research, and so on. To give a sense of the quality of the research principles drawn from the philosophy of metaReality one can for instance understand the 1M of the MELDARA model as a specific equality approach towards those one invites into the research project, based on epistemic and ontological humility. Or 2E as the ability to approach the research project from a not already knowing position, allowing for the new to come into existence.

## **Eirin Annamo** (Inland Norway University of Applied Sciences)

I have been working with the philosophy of critical realism since 2002, connecting the field of transformative learning to the philosophy of critical realism/metaReality. I relate to the three phases of critical realism as one open totality, arguing for the importance of the third phase to get the whole potential of critical realism to flourishing. Currently working in the department of education/pedagogy my research interest is to apply the philosophy of MetaReality to topics like teaching, learning, dialogue, and research methodology. Another focus is the global meta-crises where I am particularly concerned with the meaning crises.

# Parallel 5 Session 5



# Surface and depth in collaboration on complex welfare problems

Better collaboration across the welfare services are in many countries seen as necessary to meet the complex welfare and health problems among youths. Six Norwegian municipalities have implemented a project employing the "positive deviance" (PD)-approach, which is to explore positively deviant practices among the actors involved where youths have succeeded, despite various risk factors. In research linked to the project, we study characteristics of collaborative processes in PD-practices with critical realist perspectives. A key point in "PD" is to "discover uncommon but replicable behaviors and practices" Singhal & Svenkerud (2019). It is a tension between how behaviors can be replicable and not been copied, because contexts are different. A realist approach to thematic analysis by Wiltshire & Ronkainen (2021) has been helpful in the analysis of the PD-cases, as they link thematic analysis close to the three domains of reality and suggest three groups of themes, experiential, inferential and dispositional themes. This has been a meeting point between meta-theoretical assumptions from critical realism and the way we can describe and explain behaviors and practices, which is identified in the deviant cases. In this paper I will discuss these perspectives and give examples from the study.

**Lene Nyhus** (Inland Norway University of Applied Sciences)

Lene Nyhus is Associated Professor in Education at the Inland Norway University of Applied Sciences. Her research fields are communication and educational processes, interdisciplinary collaboration and meta-theoretical perspectives.



# Validating the adult social work measure 'KEY': Effectiveness of social work

Although social workers recognize the importance of evidence-based practices, they still primarily rely on their work experience and colleagues for knowledge. Therefore, validated measures that enable systematic gathering of information and development of evidence-based social work are necessary. Since 2011, "THE MEASURE" has been developed and tested to evaluate the effectiveness of adult social work interventions. This presentation describes the validation process of "THE MEASURE," which operationalizes social work goals, methods, services, and situational factors based on critical realism. The measure is integrated into client data management systems, used in daily social work, and uses the contextmechanism-outcome (CMO) configuration to open up the "black box" of social work. The validation data was collected from a cross-sectional survey of 454 adult social work clients in "COUNTRY" between 2018-2019. Confirmatory factor analysis was used to evaluate the construct validity of "THE MEASURE," and internal consistency was estimated using Cronbach's alpha. Results suggest that "THE MEASURE" has acceptable psychometric properties and can be used to evaluate the effectiveness of adult social work. However, to gain a deeper understanding of social work's effectiveness, future longitudinal studies should investigate its predictive validity.

## Minna Kivipelto Mirka Elovainio

(Finnish Institution for Health and Welfare, Finland)

Minna Kivipelto, PhD in Social Work, Research Manager, Finnish Institute for Health and Welfare. Adjunct professor of social work effectiveness evaluation in two universities. Publications: Jokela, Merita & Kivipelto, Minna & Ylikännö, Minna (2022) Social assistance beneficiaries' access to social services in a digitalised and centralised social assistance system. Sozialer Fortschritt 71 (2022), 385–404; Mesiäislehto, Merita & Kivipelto, Minna & Hiilamo, Heikki (2021) Social workers' perceptions on clients' service needs and social work practices during the COVID-19 pandemic. Journal of Comparative Social Work 16 (2), 9–35.

Mirka Elovainio, Master of Political Science and Philosophy, Researcher at Finnish Institute for Health and Welfare.



# sc Critical Realist Approach to Conceptualize Health as a Mode

We attempt to conceptualize health as a model by drawing on critical realism and the biopsychosocial framework of the International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF: endorsed by WHO in May 2001 for the multidimensional approach to health) (ICF framework). As health is multiple in its definition as typically exemplified by WHO's definition, we examine the multiplicity of health and wellbeing issues in empirical or actual domain. Retroduction of mechanisms indicates that the multiplicity of these issues may be attributable to that of mechanism in a real domain. Our mechanism-based model grasps the health as stratification of three layers provided by layered ontology: the health as generated by mechanisms in the deepest layer of real domain under the influences of contextual factors that ICF framework stipulates, the health as actualized as a whole living life in the intermediate layer of actual domain from the generated health on the four planes of four planar social being and the health as manifested as lived experiences of living life in the surface layer of empirical domain from the actualized health. As our model could interpret several different definitions of health rather consistently, it may provide a metatheoretical basis to understand health.

Kensuke Chikamori Hitoshi Yoshimura Shigeo Yamanaka Mayumi Sakamoto Akiko Yoshida (Kochi Gakuen University and Kochi Gakuen College, Japan)

#### **Parallel Session 5**



Kensuke Chikamori, Ph.D. in medical science, is an emeritus professor of Naruto University of Education and a professor of Kochi Gakuen University and College. His research interest is in the application of critical realism to education including education for sustainable development (ESD), and recently health science. He proposed Transformational model of ESD (TMESD) as a learning process of socialization from a critical realist perspective.

Hitoshi Yoshimura, Ph.D. in Education, is a professor of Kochi Gakuen University. He specializes educational psychology and has studied the development of self-expression that is supporting group adaptation of youth. Recently, he studies the relationship between sense of adaptation to club activities in school and competition characteristics in relation to the development of self-esteem in an early childhood.

Shigeo Yamanaka, Ph.D. in medicine, is a professor of Kochi Gakuen University. He specializes clinical laboratory medicine and has studied the preventive medicine, in particular, primary prevention through the investigation of lifestyle habit and guidance for improvement of health in addition with an educational approach to a local community people. He is working as academic staff to train university students who would like to be a good medical laboratory technologist.

Mayumi Sakamoto, Ph.D. in oral health and welfare, is an associate professor of Department of Dental Hygiene, Kochi Gakuen College, has investigated the spontaneous feeding ability of the elderly using Self-Feeding assessment tool for the elderly with Dementia (SFD) to study the relationship between feeding ability and mortality. From 2016, she has participated in the project organized by the Ministry of Health, Health and Welfare for the improvement of health of the elderly people. She is working as academic staff to train college students who would like to be a good dental hygienist.

Akiko Yoshida is an associate professor of Department of Nursing, Kochi Gakuen College. She specializes cancer nursing and acute care. She also participated in the study in terms of the learning from early experiential practice in basic nursing education. She is working as academic staff to train college students who would like to be a good nurse.



# **SD** Examining Homeopathic methods - Critical Realist Perspectives

Homeopathy is a therapeutic science used regularly by more than 200 million people worldwide; is included in the health systems of a number of countries, and is a regulated profession in South Africa. Despite growing popularity, the dominant positivist, logical- deductive mainstream 'Medical Science' find it to be a pseudoscience. It is indeed difficult to successfully apply a reductionist approach to homeopathy which is holistic and based upon emergence, open- systems, and dynamism. This paper argues that Critical Realism provides a useful metatheoretical position when examining the methods used in homeopathy.

Homeopathy relies on the scientific method of Provings and assumes a radically open system, a stratified reality and emergence. The method of Provings employ induction, abduction and retroduction to identify the powers/tendencies of particular substances.

Homeopathy is a therapeutic science, which relies on both the natural and the social sciences to make diagnoses and to treat. This poses challenges for applied Critical Realism, since epistemological, ontological, relational differences exist between the social and natural sciences. This raises the problem to what extent are the therapeutic sciences natural or social or both from a Critical realist perspective?

#### Natalya Dinat (Durban University of Technology, South Africa)

I am a PhD candidate at the Durban University of Technology, Faculty of Health Sciences, South Africa. PhD title is "The use of social and natural sciences in contemporary homoeopathy – an evaluation of the onto-epistemological problems." I am using Critical Realism with Dr Ingrid Schudel as my co-supervisor.

I am a medical specialist in Obstetrics and Gynecology (since 2002) and a qualified homeopath (since 2012), living and working in Johannesburg, South Africa. I am currently practising clinical homeopathy and conducting doctoral studies.

I have previously done research in biomedicine mainly in women's health, HIV/AIDS and palliative medicine. I am also a long standing activist against apartheid and for women's and ecological rights.

# Parallel 6



# Theorizing and practicing science and risk communication within a critical realism paradigm

Science and risk communication are undertheorized fields that must be redrawn with theories from the humanities and social sciences. Science and risk communication can be viewed in terms of paradigms that govern research and practice: post-positivism centers on objective knowledge and expertise, and governs dissemination models; the critical worldview sees power in those who experience reality, and governs bottom-up models; constructivism views science as a shared reality, and governs conversational models that negotiate reality. These operate on blame, however: dissemination models blame the public for ignorance, critical models blame scientists for their ideological positioning, and conversational models blame all parties for refusing to negotiate. Critical realism could be an alternate paradigm in its objective view of reality, humanization of scientific work, and aim to examine structures underlying phenomena. Research in science and risk communication could begin with hypothesizing communication, then redrawing models through constant dialogue with non-scientists. This acknowledgment of shared power between science and non-scientists can drive a communication project that is not about blame, but one that seeks to keep improving its understanding of science and risk as phenomena governed by complex social structures that need constant conversation to unearth and understand.

**Inez Ponce de Leon** (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Inez Z. Ponce de Leon, PhD holds undergraduate and master's degrees in Molecular Biology and Biotechnology from the University of the Philippines Diliman, and a PhD with a concentration on Science and Risk Communication from Purdue University. She specializes in research on science and risk communication, the nature of science, and nationalism in sports. She is also a weekly columnist for the Philippine Daily Inquirer.

More information can be found on her website, at http://inezpdl.com



# 6В From Hesitancy to Legitimacy and Beyond: A Critical Realist Multi-Case Study of Trust Culture Legitimation in the Dengvaxia Vaccine Scandal

The multinational pharmaceutical company Sanofi Pasteur developed the Dengvaxia vaccine to combat dengue fever. However, controversy arose when it was discovered that the vaccine could cause severe illness or mortality in previously uninfected individuals. This thesis investigates the news coverage, production, and reception of the Dengyaxia vaccine scandal in the Philippines to demonstrate how the scandal reinforces certain journalistic and parental trust cultures that may have limited critical analysis and comprehension of childhood vaccinations in the country. There are three case studies conducted: a textual analysis of online news reports (n=40) on news representation, semi-structured interviews with online journalists (n=10) on news production, and focus groups with vaccine-hesitant parents (n=21) on news reception. This thesis suggests that the scandal's dominant narrative was politically motivated and legitimised the medical populism of the primary authority figure, Attorney Persida Rueda-Acosta, while marginalising the perspectives of parents and Sanofi. The scandal's coverage in the news relied on the political style of medical populism, which flourishes in polarised and unequal communication environments. This thesis also reveals how online journalists reproduced the dominant narrative by simultaneously emphasising entertainment and critical analysis and the story's moral and dramatic elements. This thesis concludes that trust culture, not a specific, all-encompassing media trust problem, is the primary issue. The findings of this thesis highlight the significance of a trust culture around vaccine hesitancy and its broader implications for liberal democratic politics in the Philippines and beyond.

**Karl Patrick Mendoza** (University of Canterbury, New Zealand, and University of the Philippines Diliman)

Karl Patrick R. Mendoza is a PhD Research Candidate at the Department of Media and Communication, University of Canterbury. He is also an Instructor at the University of Santo Tomas, teaching new media writing and political communication. Karl's research interests include cultural dimensions of political communication in developing societies, with a focus on news coverage of political scandals and scientific controversies. In 2021, he was awarded the Judith Ensor Prize for Students with a Specific Learning Disability and the MFAT Postgraduate Research Development Award.



# "Don't Panic, Don't Panic": Do responses to pro-eating disorder websites within the United Kingdom (UK) constitute a moral panic?

The responses of British newspapers to websites and online content which promote eating disorders, such as anorexia nervosa and bulimia nervosa, have been described as a moral panic. I examine the development, and criticisms, of the moral panic concept. I note that there is a distinction between processual and attributional models of moral panics within the current literature. I also note that the concept has been criticised by both feminists and critical realists as it has been utilised to trivialise sexual harms. I contend that although the concept may be usefully applied to illuminate phenomena within some contexts, arbitrary uses of the concept to refer to responses to phenomena of which particular authors disapprove is indicative of the grave disorder pertaining to morality identified by the philosopher Alasdair MacIntyre. I demonstrate that neither the processual nor attributional model of moral panics, illuminate the responses to pro-eating disorder websites/online content of a representative newspaper within the United Kingdom (UK). I aver that the application of the moral panic concept to responses to proeating disorder websites/online content may trivialise eating disorders and serve as an apologia for entities which have developed, and benefit from, surveillance capitalism.

### David Benbow (University of Sheffield, UK)

Dr David I. Benbow is currently a Lecturer in Law at the School of Law at the University of Sheffield. Dr Benbow attained an LLB in Law with Politics, an LLM in Law and Society and a PhD in Law from Keele University. Dr Benbow primarily researches philosophical theories and ideologies pertaining to health and healthcare. Dr Benbow has researched reforms to the National Health Service (NHS) within England, legal cases involving disputes between parents and clinicians about the treatment of young infants and anti-vaccination ideology.



# о A Deeper Picture: A Realist Semiotics of Non-Fiction Film

This paper will present a new approach to visual research and non-fictional archive film as a practical form of critical realism. The process described aims to reveal the non-empirical structures and causal mechanisms that have generated recorded events at the empirical level. An underpinning principle of this work is that the complexity of reality can be better understood through the dialectic between facts and creative mediation. Photographic archive film is the factual material used, the intervention of film collage and montage is the site of mediation. Through this, an imagined sense of a non-empirical, complex whole is inferred through the temporal and spatial composition of image parts. In non-fictional contexts, the inferences produced address the real causes of events that can only be known theoretically and conceptually. The visual research aligns film collage processes with the operation of abduction, abstraction and retroduction in the visual field. The system developed has adapted the critical realist approach to semiotics (Bhaskar, 1993; Nellhaus, 1998; Cashell; 2009), establishing a realist form of thematic analysis, visual metonym and metaphor (Lewis, 1996; Schilbrack, 2014) that further extends a semiotics of ontological depth.

## Marc Bosward (University of Derby, UK)

My research applies critical realism to the interrogation of non-fictional film and its capacity to capture ontological depth. Specific interests include the interface of live action and animation, archive film, animation and history and memory, and the politics of experimental non-fiction film. I recently completed a practice-based PhD investigating the role of collage in non-fiction film and the construction of historical narratives at Arts University Bournemouth and University of the Arts London.

# Parallel 7 Session



# Integrating Critical Realism in Futures Studies: Understanding Agency in a Polarized Society

Traditionally, futurist studies have primarily focused on thematic approaches, such as exploring images of the future or scenario-building. However, there has been a lack of attention given to the athematic approach, which encompasses futures consciousness and its connections to cognitive skills, personalities, and analytical approaches. This article aims to address this research gap by emphasizing the concept of "agency" within the interplay between structure and culture.

By examining the recent election in Thailand, which revealed contrasting political views among different generations, this study intersects the ontological standpoint of critical realism with the morphogenesis framework. The goal is to derive insights from the analysis of contemporary political participation and develop a theoretical framework that elucidates the concept of agency across different generationa boundaries.

This research highlights the importance of considering agency as a fundamental aspect of future studies, moving beyond surface-level observations and delving into the underlying causal mechanisms that shape the agency of different generations. Through this approach, a deeper understanding of the factors influencing individual and collective decision-making processes can be gained, enabling more accurate understanding and informed interventions for future scenarios.

Critical realism theories and theoretical frameworks offer a valuable contribution to future studies by shedding light on the individual and internal conversations that shape collective futures. They also cultivate reflexivity and encourage individuals to critically engage with their own assumptions, biases, and value systems. As a result, we enhance our understanding of the complex dynamics at play and gain insight into the role of agency in shaping individual and collective futures.

#### **Nok Thasanawan Boonmavichit** (Chiang Mai University, Thailand)

Nok Thasanawan Boonmavichit is a researcher in the field of futures studies, with a particular focus on the intersection of philosophy, ethics, and social impact. Currently, she serves as a Guest Editor for the Special Issue of the Journal of Futures Studies, leading the discourse on "Al and Foresight." As an independent consultant, Nok has collaborated with diverse organizations in Asia and Europe, addressing pressing issues such as air pollution, peace and security, sustainable finance, education, healthcare, and innovative policy-making. Her research emphasizes integrating philosophical inquiry to enhance critical thinking skills and foster active citizenship in the face of emerging challenges.



# 7в Philosophy, Flourishing and Freedom: Critical Realism as Liberatory Methodology

This workshop-turned-developmental paper adopts an intersectional feminist critical realist methodological approach, with decolonial desires. Drawing on a range of realist literature, including dialectical critical realism, it introduces four guiding questions related to how, in a time of violence, conflict and catastrophe, realist philosophy might be used to theorise and enable human flourishing, freedom, and liberation. It explores these questions using key critical realist 'seed ideas' which offer generative analytical potential for anti-oppressive praxis, drawing initial conceptual links and laying groundwork for future theory and practice.

## **Angela Martinez Dy** (Loughborough University London, UK)

Dr Angela Martinez Dy is an entrepreneurial community builder invested in liberatory unlearning. As a Senior Lecturer in Entrepreneurship at Loughborough University London, her expertise, research interests and communities of practice revolve around digital entrepreneurship, antiracist intersectional cyberfeminism, and critical realist philosophy.

Her work has contributed to key advances in critical realist understandings of intersectionality, feminisms, and gender theory.



# Against Adultism: Addressing the Problem of Gerontocratic Rule in Times of Democratic Sclerosis

As opposed to the theory-driven and method-driven tendencies in political theory and science over the past decades, this thesis takes on a problem-driven approach to political theorizing and applies it to the pressing problem of gerontocratic rule in Germany. Drawing on Ian Shapiro's differentiation between problemdriven, method-driven, and theory-driven theorizing, it defends the epistemic openness of problem-driven scholarship and expands upon Shapiro's criteria for a proper problematizing redescription from a critical-realist perspective. Based on the outcome of the German Federal Election 2021, the paper then entertains an explanatory critique of gerontocratic rule in Germany and militates for a problematizing redescription of gerontocratic rule as adultism. Up to this day, the main focus both within academia and across the wider public has lied on the acknowledgement and critique of racist, sexist, and classist structures. By contrast, the systematic exclusion of the young from polities premised on adultist beliefs and misconceptions still seems socially acceptable and has received little attention thus far. This thesis spells out the need for an acknowledgment of adultism as a powerful social and political structure and points to the emancipatory potential of adultist critique.

Keywords: adultism, gerontocratic rule, problem-driven theorizing, critical realism, youth, democracy

#### **Christopher-David Preclik** (Goethe University Frankfurt, Germany)

Christopher-David Preclik graduated with an MA in Political Theory from Goethe University Frankfurt and TU Darmstadt in 2022. Before that, he earned a BSc in Psychology with a Minor in International Relations from the University of Groningen. His broader research interests are in approaches to political theory and problems of contemporary politics in Western countries. During his MA, he has come to view the phenomenon of gerontocratic rule as the defining political problem of the 21st century. The salience of intergenerational divides has led him to become involved in the international Children's Voting Colloquium and serve on its Advisory Board since 2022.



# 70 Risk as Assemblages, The Case of Basel Bank Limiting Policies as Discourses

My intention is to write about Basel bank limiting technologies from the point of view of trust, coming from the fact that banks have to adjust their own risk understanding tools and test them constantly. It is not always known what exactly causes a risk. I am interested in risk understanding technologies which do not govern this in advance, but only require passing certain risk tests. Therefore, I will research the idea of Basel's bank limiting technologies as assemblages that want connections only with other specified assemblages. For example, certain risk levels must be adjusted in order to form a harmonious whole that passes these tests. I will argue that by understanding Basel's bank limiting technologies through the theory of assemblages, it is possible to spell out the notion of biopower in the assemblage that has only a pure economic or statistical status.

This biopower means the ability of a certain bank to control its assessments by estimating those same forms in different diagrams. I will work with the condition that there are no rules as to how to control the risks, only of what the abstract risk levels must be. This is based on the standpoint of the assemblage theories idea that certain particles can be removed because the particles are tied to the whole. The point of this analysis is to show that trust does not lie in mutual understanding, but rather on the abstract risk levels and certain tests that the bank has to go through.

Trust is not created by doing something that would restrict the bank's ability to act by itself, but by making sure that the governor knows that the bank is in trouble if it does not keep risk at a certain level compared to rules that would govern how the bank has to act. It does this by using a technique that ties the bank's risks to the tools with which it normally functions. Therefore, it cannot cheat the system by using different tools in order to profit from excessive risks.

This system of certain risk technologies tied to the both sides of the bank's infrastructure is called M.A.D. (Mutually Assured Destruction) because it does not show one side without the other. Therefore, biopower is applied to the bank's risk technologies by making sure that bank knows how to work for its own well-being and at the same time also ensures that it works for the general good. This sounds a lot like an invisible hand that makes individuals' actions beneficial to the whole community. This idea seems to develop in a more instrumental fashion in this argument, but nevertheless there is the same "clever lie" behind it.

#### Joel Patomäki (University of Jyväskylä, Finland)

Joel Patomäki's first encounter with philosophy dates back to the streets of Turku while he was still cleaning ships going to Stockholm, but he has started approaching this passion in a more structured way during his gap year trip to Spain, India, China, and Australia. But his turn to philosophy was not so obvious at first as initially, when he has shown more interested in developing his street art skills that had led him to a course in contemporary hip-hop and theatre theory at the university, but the moment his interested evolved to start incorporating poststructuralism and social ontology he has eventually turned into philosophy. Currently, he is obsessed with the combination of pragmatics and posthuman thought, that he developed during his my second master's degree at Lille University where he got acquainted with both analytical and continental traditions of contemporary philosophy.

## Parallel Session



### 8A Critical realism in institutional logics research: Frameworks based on Veblen and Gramsci

Studying institutional logics, conceived as causal factors that can explain particular social practices, involves determinations and conceptions of changing structures beyond the observation of events demonstrative of instrumental institutional behavior. The conduct of institutionalized activities in statecraft and governance, for instance, can be analyzed in terms of organizing principles and ideas that develop and gain dominance over alternatives to become a fundamental part of the basis for perpetuating ways of practice definitive of current social conditions. A critical realist framework committed to maintaining the ontological distinctions between efficient structures and agents interacting over historical time can be built using theoretical perspectives that highlight the emergence of institutional elements and a process of attaining a status of dominance. The institutional economics associated with Thorstein Veblen presents a non-teleological framework for analyzing the development of institutional practices and their underlying institutional logic. The development of hegemony in state-civil society relations associated with Antonio Gramsci presents a framework for understanding how certain institutional logics attain and maintain a dominant position. While both strands of theorizing have distinctive and historically contextualized scientific worldviews, there is reasonable basis to suggest that they have fundamental features compatible with a critical realist view of social reality.

### Juan Alberto Mercado (University of the Philippines Los Baños)

Juan Alberto Mercado is a Ph.D. student taking up Development Studies at the University of the Philippines Los Baños (UPLB), where he recently joined the faculty of the College of Public Affairs and Development (CPAf). Prior to his academic pursuits, he was a corporate finance professional who served in senior executive positions in investment banking and in government, particularly in the fields of public infrastructure development.



# вв Luhmann's Systems Theory, Critical Realism, and the Morphogenetic Approach

Niklas Luhmann's social systems theory is a powerful and unique framework that has been deployed to understand various social systems such as religion, law, science, and politics. While this framework may have some similarities with Critical Realism in terms of epistemological assumptions, one key difference is the role that is played by agency in these frameworks. For Luhmann, people are not part of society and thus agency is set aside. This failure to account for agency is a central weakness of Luhmann's perspective.

This weakness may be addressed by adjusting systems theory along the lines of Archer's morphogenetic approach. This will require adjusting the way we understand two of Luhmann's key concepts: autopoiesis or the notion that social systems reproduce themselves and recursivity which assumes that future communications are framed by past communications. In the adjusted framework, social systems are understood as communications from the past that can only be reproduced by people who choose to do so. This mirror's Archer's morphogenetic argument that structures precede agency but actions on the part of agents leads to structural elaboration. This adjustment makes it possible for social systems theory to account for people and explain discontinuities in social systems.

#### **Leland Joseph dela Cruz** (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Leland Joseph Dela Cruz is an Associate Professor of Development Studies and currently serves as the Assistant Vice President for Social Development, Environment, and Community Engagement of the Ateneo de Manila University. He did his PhD studies in Sociology at the University of the Philippines Diliman where he wrote about the evolution of University Social Research Centers using Luhmann's systems theory. His dissertation proposes adjustments to Luhmann's social systems theory that will make it a more potent framework for understanding reality.



## **8c** Augmenting the Variegated Neoliberalization Thesis

The concept of neoliberalism has been criticized for its lack of empirical precision and elusiveness in heterodox political economy literature. In response, Brenner, Peck, and Theodore (2010) proposed the variegated neoliberalization thesis (VNLT), which provides a geography-based methodology for tracing the variegated processes of neoliberalization. The VNLT analyzes the movement from disarticulation to consolidation and deepening of neoliberalization. In this paper, we evaluate the VNLT theory and methodology against a time-based analysis consistent with critical realism, specifically the immanent causation morphogenetic approach (Knio 2018; Knio 2020). Our aim is to contribute to a more precise understanding of the complex dynamics of neoliberalism.

### Yazid Zahda Karim Knio

(International Institite of Social Studies, The Netherlands)

Karim Knio is Associate Professor in Political Economy and Governance at the Institute of Social Studies of Erasmus University Rotterdam. He is currently a managing editor of Journal of Critical Realism (JCR). His research focuses on the intersection between international political economy, governance and public policy with a particular interest in the literatures on varieties of capitalism, variegated neoliberalism, institutional analysis, politics of crisis management, EU Neighbourhood Policies and Lebanese politics. He is the author of various books. The latest one was a co-edited volume with Bob Jessop on the Pedagogy of Crises (2019) published by Routledge.

Yazid Zahda is a Ph.D. researcher at the International Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam. His research focuses on neoliberalism in the case of Palestine. He worked as an education specialist for the United Nations Relief and Works Agency in Palestine between 2002 and 2014. He also worked at a part-time lecturer in the European Studies Program at Al Quds University in Palestine between 2016 and 2019. He is the co-author of Local perceptions of the EU's role in peace building: The case of security sector reform in Palestine published in 2018.



# **Speculative Realism - Implications for Political Analysis?**

Over the last fifteen years speculative realism (SR) has become a significant movement in continental philosophy and has in turn has influenced research in disciplines including anthropology, architecture, English literature and the fine arts. However, to date, SR has made a rather limited impact on political analysis. This paper explores what the implications of SR philosophy might be for understanding the political. SR is intellectually diverse, and major differences exist between the guiding assumptions of leading scholars. However, what unifies SR is a commitment to challenge anti-realism and the confinement of enquiry to the 'thought-being' correlate. Many consider SR to offer a both a viable route away from anthropocentrism as well as protection against the dangers of fanaticism. Indeed, SR would seem to have the potential to reshape understandings of the politics in intriguing ways. At one level it may be thought to have a narrowing impact, in effect seeking to 'dethrone' considerations of politics and power from their privileged place within traditions of thought. However, it might also offer grounds from which to construct a more far-reaching 'decolonisation' of social science than that which currently tends to be contemplated. This paper will suggest that SR could be thought to be less than the sum of its parts due to a commitment to 'flat ontology', but also that is does offer new insights in to thinking about contingency and the possibilities of a radically transformed world.

#### **Stuart McAnulla** (University of Leeds, UK)

Stuart McAnulla is and Associate Professor of Politics at the University of Leeds. His research interests include: social science meta-theory; contemporary British politics; and the relationship of politics, religion and atheism.

## Parallel Session



# On being disciplined by our disciplines in the epoch of coloniality: Impact on epistemic access in the field of science in higher education

The nature of the discipline and the ways in which its knowers or knowledge are legitimated has an effect on education because we curriculate according to the norms and values of the discipline, but in the process, we may underestimate the ways in which what counts as important in the field can at times be exclusionary. The nature of the field thus affects how we as academic teachers approach our teaching with various effects on students' identities, learning and thus success. I use Archer's concept of situational logics to tease out how the nature of the field presents complementarities for some students but contradictions for others in the field of science in higher education. A decolonial gaze is adopted to critique the potential ideological and intellectual constraints on accessing the 'goods' of the university. I argue, there is thus a tendency of pedagogic practices and classroom traditions to perpetuate the norms and standards that favour selected groups of students to the exclusion of the majority that is beginning to enter higher education, who is known in the literature as 'non-traditional students'. Only when we draw on literacies that all students bring with them to higher education and then connect these to the literacy practices required by each discipline, can we positively impact on epistemic access even for non-traditional students.

Nkosinathi Madondo Lethukuthula Khumalo Neliswa Radebe

(Mangosuthu University of Technology, South Africa)

Nkosinathi Madondo is a lecturer in Academic Literacies in the Teaching and Learning Development Centre at Mangosuthu University of Technology where he supports students' academic literacy needs in order to enable them to succeed in higher education.



# 9в A worked example of Archer's morphogenetic approach applied to curriculum change in Higher Education

Situated within the metatheoretical framework of critical realism, Archer's morphogenetic approach (Archer, 1995) draws on her philosophical principle of analytical dualism to provide an explanatory framework for analysing the interplay between structure, culture and agency. Archer views her morphogenetic approach as one which "straddles theory and methods" (Archer & Morgan, 2020, p. 183). However, operationalising the morphogenetic approach in an empirical project is challenging. While there are some examples in the literature, detail about how critical realism informs the rationale for methodological and analytical choices is thin. This paper provides a worked example of how the morphogenetic approach was applied in a project exploring curriculum change in Higher Education. Drawing on data from interviews with academic scientists, I analysed what was conditioning agency to change the undergraduate science curriculum to include the Nature of Science (NOS), an important form of powerful knowledge for science graduates (Author, in press). The paper demonstrates how analysis of the relations between the relevant parts of structure and culture can be used to identify the situational logics acting as causal mechanisms to condition the agency of academics in curriculum change. The findings inform a more considered approach to curriculum and academic development in Higher Education.

### **Robyn Yucel** (Deakin University, Australia)

Dr Robyn Yucel is Associate Director, Learning Innovation at Deakin University, Melbourne, Australia. She holds a PhD in Higher Education from Deakin University. Robyn's research is informed by the meta-theoretical perspective of critical realism, which she uses to explore science academics' views about the Nature of Science. She has used Margaret Archer's morphogenetic approach to explore the phenomenon of curriculum change in higher education through a study of the interplay between structure, culture and agency.



# Our of 'critical thinking' in education through Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu's thought

In many countries, the concept of 'critical thinking' has been enacted in educational policies and practices. Nevertheless, this concept remains contested and conveys different definitions. Without genuinely understanding this current conceptual discussion, the state perhaps cannot implement it in schools effectively and contextually. This research attempts to respond to this challenge by firstly unpacking this notion philosophically through various terms in critical thinking. Then I will explore Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu's ideas based on Buddhist teaching, notably the two processes of 'religion' in education and 'threefold training'. Finally, I will analyse three movements of the detachment quality – distancing, gaining insight, and transforming – which enable us to move between the public realm (the vita activa) and the realm of the mind (the vita contemplativa). Drawing on these analyses, I argue that Buddhadāsa's thought helps uncover a new understanding of critical thinking that assists students in becoming competent thinkers and bringing better change to society.

Nopparat Ruankool (University College London, UK)

I am currently undertaking doctoral studies in the Department of Education, Practice and Society at the Institute of Education (IOE), University College London. I hold a BA in Philosophy from the Driyarkara School of Philosophy, Jakarta, a BA in Theology from the Pontifical Gregorian University, Rome, and an MA in Philosophy of Education from the IOE. My research interests lie in the philosophical ideas of Hannah Arendt and Buddhadāsa Bhikkhu on 'critical thinking' in education, particularly in relation to the Buddhist context in Southeast Asia.



## ор Irish Further Education and Training practitioner identities: an Archerian analysis

This paper will discuss the insights generated when a conceptual lens informed by the work of the social realist Margaret Archer (1995, 1996, 2000, 2003, 2007, 2012) in relation to identity, was applied to the data generated from 12 narrative interviews with Irish Further Education and Training (FET) practitioners as part of a doctoral research project. Archer's concepts were used to analyse the interviewees' stories in order to better understand their 'personal identities' and 'social identities', which included their professional/work identities, and how they as 'Social Actors' embodied and 'personified' their FET practitioner roles (Archer, 2000).

### **Sarah Bates Evoy** (South East Technological University, Ireland)

Sarah Bates Evoy is a lecturer in the School of Education and Lifelong Learning in the South East Technological University, Ireland. She has had a diverse and varied career as a Social Care Worker, Adult Guidance Counsellor, Further Education teacher and Higher Education lecturer and researcher. Sarah is a self-proclaimed Critical Realist and her present research interests include the training of Further Education and Training (FET) practitioners and the identities formed by experienced FET practitioners.

To view research papers and publications, please go to <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/profile/">https://www.researchgate.net/profile/</a> Sarah\_Bates\_Evoy.

### Parallel 10 Session



# **10A** Critical realism and systematic literature review: A joint approach for theory building?

The paper argues that critical realist thinking can boost the outcome of a systematic literature review (SLR), particularly in terms of theory building through synthesis. While SLR has been increasingly used in management research since the early 2000s (Rojon et al., 2016), covering various topics in management studies, critical realist thinking has also shown its utilization in SLR by authors such as Denyer et al. (2008), Pawson and Tilley (1997), and Pawson (2013). While some argue that realist evaluation methodology CIMO (i.e. context, intervention, mechanism, and outcome) developed by Denyer et al. (2008) provides a strong means to theory-building, explanation (Hawkins, 2016; Salter & Kothari, 2014; Van der Knaap et al., 2008), and contribute to knowledge development (Julnes et al., 1998), for Rojon et al. (2016) the claimed strength is not apparent – 'little is known about how such frameworks are utilized in published research, their perceived value and the extent to which they have been developed or refined' (p. 192). While Rojon et al.'s comment is rather vaque, it may well reflect that the benefits of critical realism (CR) are still not widely known to and/or fully appreciated by the majority of the management researchers. In this paper, we will reflect upon our approach to the development of a metatheory of management practice through SLR. We will highlight how CR has enabled us to synthesise, or make sense of, the known, and thus enabled us to see what is beyond the known.

### Li Li (Bath Spa University, UK)

Li Li is Senior Lecturer in Business and Management at the Bath Spa University, where she teaches undergraduate courses in tourism management, business management, and human resource management as well as supervising PhD research. She has written articles on management learning, transnational management education, the effects of technology application on users' behaviours in the perspectives of marketing, sociology, management learning, and education. Her research interests have been in management learning, managerial practice, and management issues in tourism and hospitality. Her most recent scholarly activities are centred on social formation in management and tourism through a realist philosophical lens.



## 10В Describing, Explaining, Evaluating: Applying Critical Realism To Real World Problems. Realist Evaluation Can Investigate What Works And For Whom: Utilizing Live Big Data From New York State (USA) And Manchester City Council (UK)

This is a demonstration of award-winning critical realist evaluation with live big data from New York State and Manchester City Council (UK). Research methods drawn from both epidemiology and effectiveness research traditions are demonstrated in partnership with human service agencies to investigate what programs of intervention work and for whom to enhance well-being. Binary logistic regression will be demonstrated as part of epidemiologic evidence based on association, environmental equivalence, and population equivalence. The demonstration will show how evaluators work in partnership with these agencies to undertake data analysis with them at regular intervals. Establishing cause and effect in real time is a particular theme of this demonstration. As the data mining includes all service users, it is possible to investigate the mechanism, context, and outcome configurations in real-time. This is a mixed methods approach, combining the traditions of epidemiology and effectiveness research in human services to investigate demi-regularities (Lawson, 1998, in Archer et al., Critical Realism). The author has extensive experience in evaluation of human services programs in the U.S., United Kingdom, and Finland and was awarded the US federal agency Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration's Gold Award for Outstanding Local Evaluation.

#### Mansoor Kazi (Realist Evaluation Inc., USA)

Mansoor Kazi PhD is Director of Realist Evaluation Inc. and Director of Program Evaluation Center at State University of New York at Fredonia. He has extensive experience of evaluation of human services in USA, United Kingdom and in Finland. He is CO-Chair of American Evaluation Association's Human Services Evaluation Topical Interest Group. received the Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services' Administration (SAMHSA)'s Gold Award for Outstanding Local Evaluation in July 2010. His books include 'Realist Evaluation in Practice' (2003, Sage).



## Theorizing transfactual conditions through concept formation: How critical realist and Grounded Theory researchers can collaborate in research practice

In my presentation I will put forward an argument which shows how Grounded Theory (GT) methodology can be applied to research practice under a Critical Realist (CR) perspective. Inductivism and empiricism have been proposed as the standard obstacles for bringing into dialogue the methodological premises of GT with the socio-ontological and epistemological orientations of CR. In contrast to this reading, I will try to highlight that the points of intersections of GT with CR are more powerful than the points of their divergence for theory development. I have structured my presentation in two parts: the first part brings to light the epistemological themes shared by GT and CR and in the second part I will provide a practical example to which a CR-inspired GT approach to research material has been applied. I will argue that theorizing transfactual conditions by means of retroduction (CR) is not so far from theorizing latent patterns through abduction (GT), both of which can be treated as case-based methodologies. Regarding the second part, by using research material collected through semi-structured interviews from a research project related to intercultural education, I will present the merits of a CR-inspired GT approach for combining substantive theorizing with bringing to light causal mechanisms which produce a phenomenon of interest.

#### Michalis Christodoulou (Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece)

Michalis Christodoulou holds a PhD in sociology (Department of Early Childhood Education, University of Patras), BSc in philosophy (Department of Philosophy, University of Patras) and postdoc in social theory (Department of Sociology, University of Crete). He is co-editor of Emotions, temporalities and working-class identities in the 21st century, (Nova, 2019) and co-author of Social Causation and Biographical Research: Philosophical, Theoretical and Methodological Arguments (Routledge, 2020). His research is focused on qualitative data analysis, epistemology of educational research and educational research designs. He is Assistant professor in the Department of Primary Education, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece



## **10D** Critical realist causality in case-study research

One of the core manoeuvres of critical realism is to step beyond simplistic notions of causality as a series of constant conjunctions, and beyond the empiricist concern with regularities in observable events. In response, critical realists argue that causes take the form of real but often unobservable mechanisms, which, as the properties of material, agential, ideation, and relational entities, combine in complex ways to produce outcomes. In methodological debates about case-study analysis, the nature of causality regularly comes into question, particularly in the methods of process tracing (PT) and qualitative comparative analysis (QCA). PT seeks to analyse the multiple causal steps that occur during a particular instance of social change, while QCA seeks to identify causal recipes to explain change through the presence and absence of particular combinations of mechanisms. This paper considers how critical realist theories of causality can develop – and be developed by – these methodological debates about causality. More practically, this increases the scope for mobilising critical realist theory in the application of PT and QCA methodologies, and in case-study analysis more broadly.

**Jack Newman** (University of Manchester, UK)

Jack Newman is a Research Associate at the Productivity Institute and the Department of Politics, University of Manchester. His current research sits within the Productivity Institute's 'Institutions & Governance' theme, asking whether UK productivity is constrained by the structure of its political institutions. Jack has published two papers on critical realist social theory, is a member of the JCR editorial committee and the IACR council, and co-leads a critical realist discussion group.

## Parallel 11 Session



# 11A Ontologies of the virtual world - is there a cyberspace

The new communication technology raises questions about the nature of relationships and common practices in the digital world. This paper will examine concepts such as culture, society and nature in the context of the new communications technology. Neither space nor time constraints communication in the digital world. Under these new communication conditions, what happens to notions of culture, society and nature? Corporeal presence, previously central to most relationships is now replaced by images or texts. How real are such relationships? Previously, the virtual was seen as inferior to the actual, now the virtual not only enhances the actual but replaces it with the hyperreal! This paper will examine how notions of culture, society and nature are reshaped/transformed in the virtual world!

Raul Pertierra (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Raul Pertierra is a visiting professor at Ateneo de Manila University. He is an anthropologist interested in the theory and practice as a consequence of the new communication technology.



# 11В Coming up a level? Deep and shallow ontologies in anthropology and the social sciences

Within anthropology there has been a recent turn toward ontology; the basic notion that the beliefs different cultures entertain about being and what exists in the world, results in distinctly unique, sometimes incommensurable worldviews. With recourse to people's ontological commitments as expressed in cosmologies for example, the assumption is one can also explain the 'deep structure' underlying a culture's behaviors, institutions, or social structures. While this view has intuitive appeal, the following paper attempts to present a counter case on critical realist grounds, stating that it risks running into an epistemic fallacy (i.e. asserting beliefs generate being, not the other way around). Although there is scope for regarding beliefs as casual powers, drawing on experimental data in the developmental and cognitive sciences, as well as personal ongoing ethnographic work on Chinese fortunetellers, it is argued that there remains a thornier issue; people's beliefs and values can be far less complete or logically coherent (or even consciously accessible) than what qualitative fieldwork often implies. In place of assuming 'deep structures' guided by ontological beliefs at the outset, the paper attempts to sketch how or why thinking more 'shallowly' in social science research might also be warranted.

### **Gene-George Earle** (East Normal University, China)

Gene-George Earle is currently studying for a PhD in Anthropology in China, conducting research on fortunetelling and fortuneteller techniques in a village in Northern China from a cognitive perspective. He is also strongly invested in elaborations of critical realism as a meta-theory in relation to ethnographic practice, especially comparative cultural analysis and translation.



### 11c Dimensionality in Critical Realism

As is well-known, the origins of Bhaskar's critical realism lie in a re-vindication of ontology. Bhaskar set out in his early work to identify the fundamental purpose of science as realist-depth inquiry; in so doing pushing against the tendential weight of Western philosophy-of-science to reduce ontology to epistemology. Central to establishing science as a social practice of dispositional realism, Bhaskar distinguished the 'transitive' and 'intransitive' dimensions of science (TD and ID). The case was made that while the knowledge products of scientific work are irreducible to its objects of inquiry this did not preclude forming rational judgements about those objects. This paper returns to the issues of ontological realism, epistemological relativism, and judgemental rationalism, to argue for their continued relevance to scientific inquiry, social critique, and emancipatory practice. The central task is to further explicate the place of dimensionality in critical realism and what this means for the possibility of transformative praxis.

**Grant Banfield** (University of South Australia) **Brendan Cartmel** (Independent Student)

Dr Grant Banfield is Adjunct Lecturer, Education Futures at University South Australia, and recent academic worker at Flinders University. He researches and writes on the application of Marxian social theory to educational praxis and intellectual work.

Brendan Cartmel is independent scholar and recent Masters Student at Swinburne University, Melbourne.



### 11D Learnable Enhanced Bhaskarian Ontology – LEBO

Ontological reflections on the impact of human neural systems on the way we investigate phenomena and the role of the Learnable in the way we explore and explain reality.

This intervention consolidates and builds on some of the key ideas that are included in the book Learnable Theory & Analysis by Magni, Marchetti and Alharbi, 2023. It extrapolates and expands the philosophical introductory section of the book. It concentrates on the ontological addition to Bhaskar tripartite ontology that was originally proposed in a JCR article in 2011 (Magni, 2011) and was then elaborated and applied in subsequent studies.

Here I would like to stress how the addition of the Learnable, to the tripartite ontology of Bhaskar, widens and deepens multiple areas of philosophical speculation and debate. It reinforces the focus on the alternative observational stands - objective, subjective and intersubjective - which the Learnable Enhanced Bhaskarian Ontology enacts and articulates, along with a set of key neurophenomenological hypotheses that most recent studies appear to impose onto our epistemological discourse.

#### **Luca Magni** (Luiss Business School, Italy)

Luca Magni, Professor of Practice at LUISS Business School, graduated in Philosophy at the University of Milan and completed his studies in the UK, gaining a Master of Science in Organizational Psychology at the University of Manchester and a Ph.D. in Technology Enhanced Research and Learning at the University of Lancaster.

Member of C-suites and boards for a wide range of multinationals in Italy and abroad, his latest corporate role was as Human Resources Director of the South Developed Markets in EMEA at Johnson & Johnson Medical. Before Johnson & Johnson he worked for Sorin, with the responsibility for HR worldwide. Previously he covered relevant national and international HR positions in Medtronic, Boehringer Ingelheim as well as Barilla and Ernst & Young Consultants.

Parallel to his career in business, Prof. Magni has taught and conducted research for Business Schools and Universities, both in Italy and in UK. He has also authored numerous publications within the areas of learning, problem solving, transactional analysis, leadership, change management, mergers and acquisitions.

## Parallel 12 Session 12



# Institutional entrepreneurship for inclusive business practice: A critical realist perspective

The Philippines aspires to be an inclusive society based on social justice principles articulated in its Constitution. However, amidst two decades of virtually continuous economic growth, it is beset by persistent poverty and growing inequality. The paper will describe the efforts of the university-based author to advocate, in collaboration with the Shareholders Association of the Philippines and the Management Association of the Philippines, for more inclusive business practices among large corporate firms. The advocacy applies an action research methodology based on institutional entrepreneurship theory and a critical realist meta-theory. In particular, the advocacy efforts have achieved a degree of progress in changing corporate governance policy, business education curriculum in the author's university, and the redefinition of corporate social responsibility as shared prosperity in the Management Association of the Philippines. The paper suggests that critical realism provides a fruitful meta-theory for supporting academe-led social justice advocacy toward building a more inclusive capitalist society.

### **Benito Teehankee** (De La Salle University, Philippines)

Benito Teehankee is the Jose E. Cuisia Professor of Business Ethics at the Department of Management and Organization at De La Salle University. He teaches courses in action research and strategic management. His research focuses on humanistic management, action research, and critical realism.



# 12B Social missions amid the pandemic: A critical realist explanation of select Philippine social enterprises' experiences

Social enterprises (SEs) are hybrid organizations with the dual goals of financial sustainability and social impact. This concurrent pursuit of two missions, under normal circumstances, i.e., in the absence of a crisis, generates various internal and external tensions that jeopardize the viability of these enterprises. However, the recent pandemic was an unprecedented crisis that prompted multiple lockdowns and quarantines on an unprecedented scale. The imposition of stringent control measures, such as social distancing, effectively brought a halt to normal business operations. Employees who were unable to get back to work delayed production and choked supply chains, exacerbating the demand shock that resulted in households and businesses being unable to purchase various products and services.

At the core of my research is the question of what happened to the pursuance of social mission by select social enterprises during the economic crisis. I am particularly interested in the structural entities and causal mechanisms that explain the social mission outcomes for these particular SEs. Based on a comprehensive review of the relevant literature, I developed an a priori framework proposing that there may be three possible outcomes for SEs: flourishing, adapting, and abandoning the pursuit of social objectives. The framework also promotes the notion that various structures have the ability to trigger mechanisms, and that these structures may be institutional, organizational, or individual in nature.

#### **Shieradel Jimenez** (De La Salle University, Philippines)

Ms. Jimenez is a/an teacher, school administrator, consultant, and entrepreneur by profession. She is an assistant professor at the Ramon V. Del Rosario College of Business at De La Salle University. She teaches management and organizational behavior-related subjects in undergraduate programs.



## 12c Rethinking stakeholders as whole persons: Implications for critical realist insighting in management and organizational research

In management and organizational research, we are prone to frame stakeholders primarily based on their needs contextualized with a particular system they interact with. However, this risks oversimplifying the stakeholder and ignoring their integrality as whole persons with multidimensional needs, which ultimately affects the viability of a system. Organizations can better support stakeholders and achieve their desired outcomes by understanding and addressing these diverse needs.

I offer students' social entrepreneurship within higher education as a phenomenon of interest. In the context of higher education institutions (HEIs) and social impact units, stakeholder multidimensionality is crucial for successfully supporting social entrepreneurship initiatives among students, faculty, and community partners. I build on the systems thinking concepts of "requisite variety" and "recursiveness", as well as the idea of "integral human development" to arrive at a critical realist explanation of the phenomenon. From a systems perspective, higher education institutions must have the requisite variety not only to meet the needs of students as learners but also their needs as social entrepreneurs and family members (e.g., addressing financial stability and career concerns). From the perspective of integral human development (IHD), limiting the identity of students as learners only or as social entrepreneurs is not a viable way to support their social entrepreneurship activities—their multidimensional needs must be considered because the different dimensions inevitably affect each other.

#### **Patrick Adriel Aure** (De La Salle University, Philippines)

Patrick Adriel H. Aure, PhD (Patch) is Vice-Chair and Associate Professor at the Department of Management and Organization, Ramon V. del Rosario College of Business, De La Salle University. He advocates humanistic and sustainability-oriented management research as President of the Philippine Academy of Management.



# 12D Streamlining Remote Work Operations through Critical Realist Action Research

Critical realism has been identified as a significant theoretical anchor for integrative action research, with its emphasis on empirical observation (using our senses to document events), reflection (thinking about how our senses give us an interpretation of an event that may or may not be shared by others), and collaboration (working with others to solve a problem or improve a situation). Critical realism has also proven to be highly compatible with case study research, particularly emphasizing change management to improve work processes and systems. The use of integrative action research in a case study is emphasized in this paper. The Digital Partnerships and Fintech team of Company X streamlined their operations by introducing the use of a tool to consolidate the projects and activities as well as to foster better collaboration and communication among the members. Tasked to enable the company digitally, the team needed to deliver projects and future-proof solutions. The challenges of a remote work set-up coupled with the team's lack of an established system of collaboration and managing its operations have resulted in missed deadlines and incomplete tasks. Projects were not delivered on time. To solve this problem, the team utilized various action research tools and a methodology of systems analysis and collaboration to test and use a project management tool (Trello) to create a consolidated view of the team's projects and deliverables. The use of integrative action research resulted in a humanized Project Management Framework, which can guide teams in employing a balance of scientific methods and humanistic elements in managing projects. Organizations could learn from the exercise and use the results of the study as a reference in implementing a system of managing operations, especially in a work-from-home setup.

## Janice Alfonso Frances Jeanne Sarmiento

(De La Salle University, Philippines)

Janice Alfonso is a lecturer at the De La Salle University - Ramon V Del Rosario College of Business where she finished her Master in Business Administration degree. Apart from her teaching duties, she is also a Doctor of Business Administration student at San Beda University and a product manager for a multinational life insurer in the Philippines.

Frances Jeanne L. Sarmiento is an Assistant Professorial Lecturer at the Ramon V. del Rosario College of Business of De La Salle University (DLSU) in Manila, Philippines. She teaches Management Principles, Strategic Human Resource Management, and International Business Agreements. She also serves as a thesis/capstone project adviser to MBA students. She has MBA and Ll.B. degrees and is currently a candidate for the Ph.D. in Development Studies at DLSU. Prior to teaching, she held supervisory, managerial, and executive positions in the Philippine government that involved bilateral trade negotiations, finance and administration, and human resource management.

## Parallel 13 Session



# **IBA** Explaining the drivers of community immersion outcomes among medical students: a realist-informed study

Introduction: The effects of community immersion programs and other forms of community-based medical education on students have been highlighted in the literature. However, the driving factors that generate these outcomes are not emphasized by many authors. This study aimed to identify and explain the important contextual factors and mechanisms, considered as driving factors of the outcomes of community immersion programs. Methods: An explanatory qualitative inquiry that employed focus group discussions, in-depth interviews, and reflection papers was utilized. The realist approach provided the structure in eliciting and analyzing medical student's perspectives on the driving factors of the program outcomes of community immersion. Data were analyzed through thematic analysis. Results: The outcomes generated by the community immersion program are consistent with the literature as well as relevant to the course and social outcomes as identified by University X. Uncovered major driving factors for these program outcomes include: "perceiving things from a different perspective", and "positive attitude towards community health". Various contextual factors that trigger these driving factors were further unpacked that provide a backdrop to the community immersion program. Conclusion: Factors that bring about the program outcomes of community immersion are evident in the experiences of medical students. Focusing on these factors may allow community preceptors and administrators to have clearer perspectives on the factors to focus on in teaching community medicine through community immersion. It is recommended that preceptors and administrators to consider and nurture these factors during community immersion to be effective in teaching medical students in the community setting and in the provision of primary health services to communities.

### Celso Pagatpatan, Jr.

(De La Salle Medical and Health Sciences Institute, Philippines)

Celso P. Pagatpatan, Jr., is a faculty member of the Department of Family and Community Medicine, De La Salle Medical and Health Sciences Institute. He is a member of various health research societies including the National Research Council of the Philippines. His research interests center on community-based medical education, access to health care services, and public participation in health policy. He teaches qualitative research, mixed methods research, realist and scoping review designs and co-teach research methods. He is also an adjunct research fellow of Torrens University Australia.



## 13В Reforming Assessment Practices in Healthcare Using Critical Realist Methodology

Traditional approaches to assessment in healthcare education usually comprise of a clear dichotomy between formative assessments and high-stakes 'objective' and structured summative examinations. Limitations of positivist nature of traditional assessment system in capturing the nuances of clinical competence has led to an alternate approach to assessment called as programmatic assessment. In this large-scale implementation study of programmatic assessment, we unpacked the impacts as perceived by students and faculty using critical realist perspectives. The focus of this presentation is to describe how we used ontological stratification and Archer's concept of morphogenesis/morphostasis as a conceptual framework and abduction and retroduction as methods that enabled us to unpack conditions that may be necessary for such an assessment approach to thrive. We conclude the 'real' mechanisms involved interplay between assessment structures and cultural systems that provided conditions (constraints and enablers) and conditioning (acceptance or rejection of new 'non-traditional' assessment processes) that impacted agency of students and faculty.

#### **Priya Khanna** (University of Sydney, Australia)

Priya Khanna is an educationalist working in curriculum development and Indigenous health in medical education. She holds a PhD in Education. She is particularly interested in applying critical realist perspectives for complex curricular change.



# 13c Relationships, relational configurations and relational goods: how patients and clinicians manage stigma together

We examine the relationships between dirty workers and their clients to understand whether and how the two groups manage stigma together. Our study is based on an ethnography conducted in a wound healing clinic, where clinicians who do dirty work that attracts courtesy stigma care for patients with socially stigmatised wounds. Our analysis is indebted both to realist relational social theory (Donati & Archer 2015) and to extant studies of how people cope with dirty work through techniques of refocusing, reformulating and recalibrating stigma (esp. Ashforth & Donati & Streiner, 1999). Empirically, we identify three types of patient-clinician relationships: of familiality, scripted compliance and obstruction. For each type of relationship, we trace the conditions of possibility (theorised as a relational configuration) and the plausible effects (theorised as relational goods and evils) on patients' and clinicians' capacity to cope with stigma together.

**Ismael Al-amoudi** (Grenoble Ecole de Management, France) **Anna Milena Galazka** (Cardiff Business School, UK)

Ismael Al-Amoudi (presenter) works as a Full Professor at Grenoble Ecole de Management and is a member of the IACR Council. In his spare time, he works as Director of the Centre for Social Ontology (www.socialontology.org), Associate Editor of Organization, Editorial Board Member of Organization Studies, and Academic Advisory Board Member of the Independent Social Research Foundation. His research combines realist and post-structuralist social theory to understand contemporary organisational mechanisms, with a particular interest in normativity, violence and de/humanisation. He has published two edited books on post-human society (Routledge), several book chapters on social theory (Springer; Routledge) and scholarly articles in top journals of management, economics, sociology and social theory.

Anna Milena Galazka (first author) is a Lecturer in management, employment and organisation at Cardiff Business School. Her primary research interests include the transformative power of positive relationships and community, reflexivity, social innovation, emancipation, stigma and dirty work, which she has explored in the context of wound healing medical work. Her additional research interests include knowledge management and learning, entrepreneurship and new ways of working and organising work. Her work has been published in several journals spanning different disciplines, including Sociology of Health & Dilness, International Wound Journal, British Journal of Community Nursing and International Review of Administrative Sciences.



Residents' coping responses in collaborative housing during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Applying Bhaskar's four-planar social being to tackle the affordability-integration-health nexus

The COVID-19 pandemic was a global health, social and housing crisis. City lockdowns, stay-at-home and social distancing requirements were preventive restrictions increasing residents' loneliness in regular housing stock. Collaborative housing is an alternative community-led housing form where people live in complete apartments whilst sharing common spaces and resources, enabling socializing and mutual support. The paper reflects on the process of applying Bhaskar's four-planar social being for designing a methodology to evaluate residents' coping responses in collaborative housing during the pandemic. The methodology includes iterative stages such as integrative literature review, refining the conceptual framework and research questions, designing, pilot-testing and improving mixed-methods data collection tools and collecting empirical data. Data analysis focuses on (a) residents' material transactions with the common spaces and the neighbourhood, (b) social interactions between residents in everyday life, (c) social relations with institutions and (d) the stratification of personality, which for this paper implies how residents influenced each other's motivations, habits and agency. This approach enabled analysis at the intersection of housing affordability, social integration and health. The paper sheds light on the pros and challenges of having critical realism as a foundation for inter- and transdisciplinary mixedmethods research.

Ivette Arroyo (Lund University, Sweden)
Catherine Hastings (Macquarie University, Australia)
Maryam Khatibi (Université de Lyon, France)
Norma Montesino (Lund University, Sweden)

#### **Parallel Session 13**



Ivette Arroyo holds a PhD in construction and architecture from Lund University. Her research focuses on housing recovery processes and user involvement from a critical realist perspective. Her current research focuses on collaborative housing, social integration and residents' coping responses to the COVID-19 pandemic. Dr. Arroyo is the co-lead of the inter- and transdisciplinary project "Collaborative Housing in a Pandemic Era (CO-HOPE)", focusing on the housing affordability, social integration and health nexus, carried out in five European countries.

Catherine Hastings holds a PhD in sociology from Macquarie University.

Her interdisciplinary research concentrates on understanding issues of social justice and inequality alongside developing and evaluating policy and program responses for social change.

Recent focus areas include legal needs assessment, the causes of homelessness for families and older women, and international student financial and housing precarity. The philosophy of critical realism informs her research.

Maryam Khatibi holds a PhD from the department of Architecture and Urban Studies, DAStU, Politecnico di Milano. She was project leader of "Collaborative Housing in Zurich" supported by SEED funding ISCN, EPFL, Switzerland. She has been the co-author of Scales of Interiors: Parks, Garden, Objects (2019) and collaborates with developing tools for transdisciplinary, and participatory process design. Dr. Khatibi is a postdoctoral fellow in the project "Collaborative Housing in a Pandemic Era" (CO-HOPE).

Norma Montesino studies international migration in Sweden including the links between migration policies and the use of medical categories in the conceptualization of human mobility and social problems. More recently works in interdisciplinary teams studying sustainable ways of living together in collaborative housing that promote social integration in contexts of intergenerational and ethnic diversity. Current inter- and transdisciplinary project focuses on the nexus affordability, health, and social integration in coping responses to the COVID-19 pandemic in collaborative housing in Europe.

## Parallel 14 Session



### 14A Wendt Revisited: A Refreshed Challenge for International Relations Constructivism

Alexander Wendt's Social Theory of International Relations (1999, SOTIP) was a landmark work for International Relations as a discipline, giving birth to the constructivist school of IR theory. Wendt had been an advocate for critical realism (CR) from his earlier work on the structure-agency problem in IR, SOTIP marked a turning point from CR and argued for a greater primacy of discursive theory and individualist accounts of IR. SOTIP cites Actor-Network Theory, Structuration Theory and symbolic interactionism for his foundational assumptions. While Wendt has moved on from its theoretical development and debate has slowed, Critical Realist thinkers have continued to debate these three approaches. By accounting for modern CR arguments and the respective debates with the three latter schools, we can more closely link ontological blindspots with the emergent weaknesses in the practice of IR constructivism today. I argue that IR constructivism's ontological blindspots disallows it from distinguishing the effectiveness of different normative ideas in their cascade amongst IR actors, and it privileges survivorship bias in the analysis of normative ideas. A critical realist dynamic of the real is needed to complement existing constructivist methodology to better explain and predict the development of norms.

### Yi Jian Ho (Sunway University, Malaysia)

Ho Yi Jian is currently a research analyst at the UN Sustainable Development Solutions Network, Asia HQ based in Sunway University, Malaysia. Parked under the institutional design section, his research focuses on SDG 16, freedom of information and international relations. He has worked for the Jeffrey Cheah Institute on Southeast Asia, Kuala Lumpur and the International Institute on Strategic Studies (IISS) based in Singapore. He holds a postgraduate MA in International Relations from the Australian National University and an honours degree in Political Science from the National University of Singapore.



### 14в China's 'indisputable' framing of the 'Taiwan question': Discourse with 'Chinese characteristics'

Although Taiwan is a liberal democracy with a significant economy that fulfils the criteria of statehood outlined in the 1933 Montevideo Convention, it remains diplomatically isolated in the international community. Framed by Chinese propaganda as 'a part of China', Beijing's global campaign to restrict Taiwan's engagement internationally has prevented it from participating in multilateral organisations such as the WHO, despite its Covid-19 success.

Moreover, as part of its relentless and vast political communications strategy to shape its preferred 'reality', China attempts to convince the world that 'reunification is a process that cannot be halted' and is purely an 'internal affair'. These views are reinforced by leveraging trade and supply chains in addition to its diplomatic resources, creating an environment where, coupled with fears of China's increasing belligerence, it becomes easier for governments to accede to China's increasing authoritarian encroachment of Taiwanese sovereignty.

This paper subjects these ideological and irredentist claims outlined in China's 2022 White Paper and wider public diplomacy programmes to explanatory critique. In doing so, it highlights the dangers of internalising Chinese deceptions that risk becoming self-fulfilling with catastrophic consequences for both Taiwan and the geopolitical distribution of powerwhen such outcomes are by no means inevitable.

Martin Evenden (National Taichung University of Education, Taiwan)

Martin Evenden is Assistant Professor in the Department of English at National Taichung University of Education (Taiwan).



## 14c "No Abe, Yes Japan" Movement in 2019: Bolstering National Pride and Identity

Park Geun-Hye's hasty and inadequate agreement to settle the Japanese military "comfort women" issue with the Japanese government led by Abe Shinzo in December 2015 turned out to be devastating to the victims and the majority of socially and historically conscious South Koreans. Following Park's impeachment and the election of Moon Jae-In, the Korean government faced a few ongoing related legal cases and attempted to redress the matter, which then angered Japan's Prime Minister Abe who appeared to look down upon the Korean nation-state. Abe instigated a trade provocation, creating obstacles for some Japanese corporations exporting a few key products to Korean electronics companies. As a response to this trade provocation, Koreans initiated a large-scale boycott against Japan-the "No Abe, No Japan" movement.

### **Gil-Soo Han** (Monash University, Australia)

Gil-Soo Han is a Professor of Communications and Media Studies, Monash University, Australia. His areas of research interest include media, religion, health, ethnicities, and nationalism. His recent publications include Funeral Rites in Contemporary Korea (2018, Springer), Nouveau-riche Nationalism and Multiculturalism in Korea (2015, Routledge).



### 14D Psychoanalysis and Democracy

This presentation uses psychoanalytic object relations theory and attachment theory to describe the democratic personality, that is, the personality structure that promotes democracy. Democracy is government of, by, and for the people, that is, participatory self-rule. It requires negotiation and compromise, in which each party gives up getting everything they want so that all parties can get something that they want. The presentation examines the personality structure that make negotiation and compromise possible. It assumes that psychological structures formed in early infancy create templates for later adult political behavior. Given healthy "good enough" early development infants develop a relational template of negotiation and mutuality, in which their needs can be met by a "good object" whose needs are also met. This template is a framework for democratic negotiation in which both parties can be "good enough" for each other, and thus compromise in order to reach mutually satisfactory agreements.

### **Carl Auerbach** (Yeshiva University, USA)

Carl Auerbach is an Emeritus Professor at the Ferkauf Graduate School of Psychology, Yeshiva University. His research area is in the psychology of trauma, with a particular focus on collective social. trauma. In 2011 he was awarded a Fulbright fellowship to teach and do research at the National University of Rwanda. His thoughts on democracy were prompted by his experiences in post-genocide Rwanda.

### Parallel 15 Session 15



### 15A Conflating the Metaphysical and Semantic

Whether unobservables exist and how we know and tell about their existence are usually entangled with each other. Conflating the metaphysical issues with the semantics has led many to anti-realism. Devitt surmises that this tendency to conflate the semantic with the metaphysical stems from the linguistic turn in philosophy wherein philosophical issues have all become about language. In the literature on realism, a common overriding feature of scientific realism of its different proponents is that its doctrines are mostly semantic. Then there are the critical realists like Niiniluoto who espouse that "scientific theories are either uncertain-but-probably true or false-but-truthlike hypotheses." Niiniluoto (1999) asserts that he tries to make precise "the idea that good scientific theories typically are false but nevertheless close to the truth. The history of science and philosophy has shown, however, that the question of an external and independent reality is not a given—not something we automatically assume even if the way we do science and investigate the world is rooted in this seeming commonsense assumption. There are various forms and slants of realism that belie the assumed commonsensicality of such a philosophical stance. This paper asserts that unobservables posited by mature scientific theories exist independently of the cognitive activities of the human person.

**Vida Mia Valverde** (Ateneo de Davao University, Philippines)



# 15B You Don't Have to Be Abstracted from the World to Know: Rethinking the Contemporary Knowing Subject

The forms of knowing which shape our global civilization are defined by abstract scientific means of acquiring and producing knowledge. These abstract, systematic modes of knowledge acquisition and creation have been accepted as the prime, if not only, legitimate source of knowledge such that all other forms of knowing are evaluated according to its systems of abstract conceptualization. However, this systematic and abstract form of human knowing is the product of a period of Western civilization which sought to impose on the natural world and its othered civilizations its sense of order and development.

The contemporary scientific rationality is founded of a modernist understanding of how the human person knows the reality and the resulting necessity of abstracting the knowing subject from the presencing world. This paper will demonstrate how modern philosophy defined human subjectivity in a way that has confined genuine human knowing in what Heidegger calls enframing.

The paper will further argue that other ways of discovery or methodologies must be given more prominence in the furthering of human knowing because they present other ways of experiencing, opening to, knowing and being in the world that are less destructive because they posit being a subject immersed in, vs abstracted from, the presencing world.

**Agustin Martin Rodriguez** (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Agustin Martin G. Rodriguez is a professor of philosophy of the Ateneo de Manila University. He has published on the philosophies of poverty, social justice, environmental justice, and just and sustainable development.



### 15c Language and Translation in Bhaskar's notion of Scientific Development

Scientific development has ordinarily been characterized as a direct process of acquisition and accumulation that simply expands previous theories. Sociological analyses attentive to the actual practice of science however, present a more nuanced vision involving tension and breaks in the development and application of theories within a specific community. Thomas Kuhn's "paradigm shift" characterizes this change in the meaning of theories and objects as a break between two different "worlds." Such a divergence encounters the problem of translation since language seems to fail to properly communicate meaning. Since the meaning of scientific content is different on either side of the paradigm, what assures that we are speaking about the same thing? Using Roy Bhaskar's notion of scientific development in his A Realist Theory of Science, I examine the role of language and natural kinds in addressing the problem of translation. Considering the stratification of the world, Bhaskar's logic of scientific discovery preserves both an ontological depth of the world and a social dimension of knowledge production. Scientific theories have as their shared object the world. While Bhaskar considers conceptual change a necessary consequence of the discovery of different strata of reality, I present the form of Bhaskar's response as lying in the endeavor to design communication and language by considering the very features and conditions of the strata in which the meaning of two different theories unfolds. Such conditions are the very ambit in which clarification and translation ensue.

### **Darren Anthony Cabildo** (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)

Darren O. Cabildo is an MA in Philosophy candidate at the Ateneo de Manila University. His research interests lie in aesthetics (particularly in ideas relating to photography, cinema, and games) and philosophy of language. His current research focuses on "The Difference between Deleuze's and Derrida's Interpretations of Husserl's Concept of Sense".



# The Concept of Language: Bridging Critical Realism and Wittgenstein

A large part of 20th century continental and analytic philosophy has been centered around the question of language and the way in which meaning is produced and conveyed. This paper investigates the concept of language through the lens of critical realism. Proceeding by way of conceptual analysis of critical realism's concepts of a stratified ontology, emergence, and causality, my aim is to draw out certain features of a critical realist notion language. I attempt to show that language has social pre-conditions which necessitate the re-situating of the concept of language within a dialectical relation between language users and their lifeworld. And I explore the possibility of bringing Wittgenstein's notions of 'meaning as use' and 'language game' to a critical realist view of language through the concept of semiosis.

**Ian Gabriel Kintanar** (Xavier University–Ateneo de Cagayan, Philippines)

Ian Gabriel Kintanar is a faculty of Xavier University – Ateneo de Cagayan Department of Philosophy. He has recently obtained his master's degree in philosophy at the Ateneo de Manila University. His field of interest include virtue epistemology, philosophy of education, and critical realism.

